

PAUL J. RIEHLE (SBN 115199)  
paul.riehle@faegredrinker.com  
**FAEGRE DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH LLP**  
Four Embarcadero Center  
27th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 591-7500  
Facsimile: (415) 591-7510

CHRISTINE A. VARNEY (*pro hac vice*)  
cvarney@cravath.com  
KATHERINE B. FORREST (*pro hac vice*)  
kforrest@cravath.com  
GARY A. BORNSTEIN (*pro hac vice*)  
gbornstein@cravath.com  
YONATAN EVEN (*pro hac vice*)  
yeven@cravath.com  
LAUREN A. MOSKOWITZ (*pro hac vice*)  
lmoskowitz@cravath.com  
M. BRENT BYARS (*pro hac vice*)  
mbyars@cravath.com

**CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP**  
825 Eighth Avenue  
New York, New York 10019  
Telephone: (212) 474-1000  
Facsimile: (212) 474-3700

*Attorneys for Plaintiff and Counter-defendant  
Epic Games, Inc.*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
OAKLAND DIVISION**

Case No. 4:20-cv-05640-YGR-TSH

EPIC GAMES, INC.,  
  
Plaintiff, Counter-defendant,  
v.  
APPLE INC.,  
  
Defendant, Counterclaimant.

**EPIC GAMES, INC.'S SUR-REPLY  
IN RESPONSE TO APPLE INC.'S  
REPLY IN SUPPORT OF ITS  
MOTION TO STRIKE WRITTEN  
AND ORAL TESTIMONY OF DR.  
MICHAEL I. CRAGG**

The Honorable Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

1 Epic Games, Inc. (“Epic”) respectfully requests leave to submit this sur-reply solely to  
 2 address Apple’s gross mischaracterization of Dr. Cragg’s trial testimony and the Compass  
 3 Lexecon report Epic has provided to the Court, per the Court’s request.<sup>1</sup>

4 Apple asserts that Dr. Cragg misrepresented to the Court that he reviewed the exact  
 5 Compass Lexecon reports excerpted in the two JFTC submissions, instead of the variant of that  
 6 report, discussing the very same experiment, that Epic submitted to the Court. Not so. When  
 7 asked by Apple’s counsel whether he reviewed the Compass Lexecon report excerpted in the  
 8 two JFTC submissions, Dr. Cragg specifically testified that “I -- I don’t remember the exact  
 9 composition. I have read a Compass Lexecon report that, for instance, [REDACTED]  
 10 [REDACTED] Trial Tr. 2339:16-20 (emphasis added). Counsel for Apple then asked Dr.  
 11 Cragg whether he had the complete report “referred to here”, without specifying whether he  
 12 meant the report referred to in the document, or the one Prof. Cragg had “referred to” in the  
 13 preceding question, to which Dr. Cragg replied “yes”. Later, when asked by the Court whether  
 14 he believed the truth of the numbers contained in the Spotify JFTC submissions, Dr. Cragg  
 15 again answered “there’s a report from Compass Lexecon” that he reviewed that describes the  
 16 same experiment described in the JFTC submissions. Trial Tr. 2344:8-14 (emphasis added).

17 This testimony was all accurate and truthful, and Apple’s attack on Dr. Cragg is  
 18 misleading in the extreme. Epic previously provided a copy of the Compass Lexecon report  
 19 that Dr. Cragg discussed to the Court and is providing another copy with this sur-reply. (Even  
 20 Decl. Ex. A.) That report describes a December 2018 experiment that is the same as that  
 21 described in Spotify’s two JFTC submissions. [REDACTED]  
 22 [REDACTED]  
 23 [REDACTED] (Even Decl. Ex. A at 9.) [REDACTED]  
 24 [REDACTED]  
 25 [REDACTED]

26  
 27 <sup>1</sup> Epic disagrees with various other factual assertions and arguments presented in Apple  
 28 Inc.’s (“Apple”) reply in support of its motion to strike portions of Dr. Cragg’s testimony and  
 the supporting declaration, but does not believe these disagreements require a sur-reply.

1 [REDACTED]. (*Id.*; PX-1152 at 2; PX-1153 at 2.) The  
2 report is exactly as Dr. Cragg described it, and supports his opinions for the reasons he testified  
3 to.

4 For these reasons, as well as those laid out in Epic's initial opposition, Apple's motion  
5 to strike should be denied.

Dated: May 18, 2021

CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP

Christine Varney (*pro hac vice*)  
Katherine B. Forrest (*pro hac vice*)  
Gary A. Bornstein (*pro hac vice*)  
Yonatan Even (*pro hac vice*)  
Lauren A. Moskowitz (*pro hac vice*)  
M. Brent Byars (*pro hac vice*)

FAEGRE DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH LLP

Paul J. Riehle

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Yonatan Even  
Yonatan Even

*Attorneys for Plaintiff and Counter-defendant  
Epic Games, Inc.*